

masterly and indisputably impressive demonstration of the harmonies that can sometimes emerge.

James Orr
 Christ Church
 Oxford OX1 1DP
 UK
 Email: james.orr@chch.ox.ac.uk

Newman and Life in the Spirit: Theological Reflections on Spirituality for Today edited by John R. Connolly and Brian W. Hughes (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2014), xi + 236 pp.

Few doubt that John Henry Newman is one of the great modern Christian thinkers. Indeed, there is widespread acknowledgment that his contributions to topics such as the rationality of faith, the development of doctrine, the nature of the university, the role of the laity, and the relationship between conscience and authority deserve landmark status. However his common recognition as a canonical figure, evident most recently in his 2010 beatification, can engender the impression that his thought has already been successfully received. Without questioning either the value of his texts as 'classics' or the importance of their influence during the past two centuries, one may harbor the opinion that his writings are a dry well when it comes to current matters of theological concern. This collection of essays argues to the contrary that approaching Newman through his largely neglected contribution to spirituality sheds fresh light on his contemporary significance. Its ten chapters were produced by participants in a Catholic Theological Society of America (CTSA) Interest Group on the Spirituality of John Henry Newman from 2011 to 2013, which was co-moderated by the editors. Unlike some such volumes, this one has considerable thematic integration. The editorial introduction sets the tone with a strong thesis, contending that the key to Newman's spirituality and its relevance today is his doctrine of the indwelling of the Holy Spirit. Connolly and Hughes argue that Newman presents Christian practice as the progressive realization of the presence of the Holy Spirit in all aspects of life. They interpret this spirituality as the fruit of his distinctive appropriation of biblical and patristic discourses of deification or *theosis*. Thus from their perspective Newman envisions the spiritual life as the transformative maturation of the whole person in and through communion with the Triune God.

This interpretation of Newman is advanced most fully in Connolly's two chapters. There he emphasizes that for Newman the indwelling of the Holy Spirit imparts the living communion of the Trinity into the heart of the human person, establishing a vivifying principle that gradually effects a comprehensive, holistic transformation. By sharing in the "intimate friendship" of the Father and the Son, the human person becomes animated by that charity which Newman regards as another name for the Spirit. Connolly attributes Newman's signature concept of development to his profound insight into the gradual, progressive way that the Spirit sanctifies diverse human persons, joining them together as members of one body and slowly guiding them toward deeper realizations of the truth, peace, joy, and unity of the Spirit. For Newman, Connolly explains, the effects of this sanctification are made visible not only in personal and ecclesial life but also in the full spectrum of "temporal affairs" through inspired fulfillment of "worldly duties." Importantly, this vision leads Newman to believe that life in the Spirit has been, is, and will be characterized by an ongoing process of growth and change. Therefore Newman eschews the presumption that a vital Church or a healthy Christian tradition could look like anything other than a dynamic, living organism: ever adapting and extending and diversifying as the Spirit hallows human persons of every tribe and tongue from every place and time.

All the other essays address some aspect or implication of this interpretation of Newman as a teacher of trinitarian spirituality attuned to the dynamics of how human life develops in the Spirit. John Ford shows the importance of the concepts of change, development, and progress in Newman's spirituality by analyzing the theme of "conversion" in his writings. He argues that for Newman conversion is gradual and cumulative but has defining moments and turning points. He demonstrates that Newman's view of conversion is "postmodern" in the sense of valuing human experience, abjuring triumphalism, affirming perspectivalism, and promoting informal inference.

Kenneth Parker contends that Newman's spiritual journey provided the prism through which he came to a dynamic view of church history. If development amidst historical change is natural in the relation of the human person to God, Newman reasons, one should also expect an analogous phenomenon in the histories of religion and Christianity. In perhaps the most original essay of the book, Donald Graham argues that Newman's trinitarian theology is the source of his ideas about divine sympathy and his spirituality of sanctified human sympathy. According to Graham, Newman valorizes interpersonal sympathy as an imitation of and participation in the mysterious *circuminsessio* of the Trinity; from this perspective the divine *philanthropia* of the Incarnation gives the human race the gift of sharing divine sympathy. Newman had a famous penchant for deep, spiritual friendships, and Graham's essay uncovers one important theological rationale for this practice.

Almost every essay in this book is a substantial piece of scholarship that analyzes primary texts, engages an array of secondary literature, and makes a thoughtful argument for Newman's contemporary significance. Exemplary in each regard is Theodore Whapham's essay. He shows that Newman breaks decisively with nineteenth-century trends in trinitarian theology. While so many were excising it as extraneous, reducing it to an appendix, or contracting it to a rational concept, Newman anticipated the twentieth-century trinitarian renewal by presenting a vision of the Trinity as the consummation of lived Christian experience. Rather than going on the fool's errand of attempting to justify trinitarian doctrine through abstract reasoning, Newman explains that real assent to trinitarian doctrine is the fruit of imaginative, affective experience of Scripture reading, liturgy, prayer, and devotional practice. Belief in the Trinity emerges via the integration of so many images, symbols, and narratives received in doxological contexts as ordinary persons of faith are formed for mission. Danielle Nussberger elaborates on this "missional" feature by explaining how the mark of Christ's presence is essential to Newman's spirituality. She traces this idea through Newman's teachings on the topics of Incarnation, Mary, and the Eucharist, showing that in his sermons the Church is defined by the perpetuation of Christ's presence in the world by the power of the Spirit. Ryan Marr furthers the Marian theme, arguing that Newman's view of Mary as an exemplar of faith yields a spirituality of receptivity to and contemplation of divine truth. He presents this as a middle way between fideism and rationalism that can guide and deescalate the conflicts over the ongoing reception of Vatican II. Hughes discusses the role of the communion of saints and of St. Philip Neri specifically in Newman's spirituality. He shows that the doctrine of the indwelling of the Spirit is deeply connected to Newman's idea of the saint as a personal presence that uniquely embodies Christian virtue and constitutes nothing less than the best case for the truth of Christianity. Hughes also explains how Newman integrates the often divergent models of the saint as patron and friend by emphasizing her role as a guide along our common path toward the City of God. In the last essay Kevin Mongrain argues that Newman's doctrine of the indwelling Spirit is the fruit of ancient Alexandrian influence and that there is a great kinship between the Alexandrian theology of salvation as deification and St. Philip Neri's spirituality, which explains Newman's affinity for the Oratorian vocation.

By approaching Newman through his spirituality, this volume transcends the polarization between those who see Newman as a "conservative apologist" for the authority and doctrines of the Roman Catholic Church and others who regard him as a "liberal advocate" for its progressive reform on the basis of the primacy of conscience and the historicity of tradition. As presented here, Newman's teaching on the Spirit and human development challenges this highly politicized modern opposition. For Newman, human sanctification by the Spirit involves the perpetuation of Christian tradition and the virtuous exercise of human conscience, engagement in devotional practices and participation in social transformation, faithful reception of church teaching and vigorous intellectual inquiry, etc. Thus an important implication of this volume is that Newman's spirituality is a primary source of his extraordinary ability to navigate the middle way between dueling extremisms that have divided Christians in modernity. Another significant contribution of this book is that Newman's work as an "apologist" or public Christian rhetor is formed by his ideas about the growth of human persons in the Spirit. Whereas Newman's more philosophical and literary texts are often studied independently of his explicitly religious writing on spirituality and theology, this text illuminates the fundamental role that the content of the latter plays in the style and the aims of the former. In short, all of Newman's writings are attempts to meet concrete persons wherever they are and help advance their spiritual development. In this regard, *Newman and Life in the Spirit* arguably renews an approach to Newman promoted by Erich Przywara, Jan Walgrave, and Terrence Merrigan. Any word of criticism for a rich collection of essays such as this would have to

be minor, as is mine. Without questioning the centrality of the chosen theme, I would submit that a balanced interpretation of Newman's spirituality requires more attention to its "darker side." The spiritual development of human persons is for Newman certainly about our growth into communion with the Trinity, but that work is for Newman also a battle with enemies such as Satan, Anti-christ, the world, sin, and self. Newman's thought features profound analyses of the dangers, obstacles, and pitfalls of spiritual life; he is at least as great a critic of corruption as he is an exponent of development. For Newman, the Christian life is organically continuous in the long term, but it is also a dramatic *agon* full of crises, tragedies, ruptures, and setbacks in the short term. Thus a complete rendering of Newman's spirituality would require, borrowing a line from his second *Oxford University Sermon*, "neither light nor darkness but both together."

Damon McGraw
 Department of Theology
 Fisher Hall 601
 Duquesne University
 Pittsburgh, PA 15282
 USA
 Email: mcgrawd@duq.edu

Old Testament Theology: Reading the Hebrew Bible as Christian Scripture by R.W.L. Moberly (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2013), xiv + 333 pp.

Old Testament Theology draws together, refines and develops earlier studies by Walter Moberly into an integrated volume of superb quality, in which Moberly's distinctive and gently persuasive voice is heard afresh and with clarity. Moberly's approach to Old Testament theology (in keeping with his *The Theology of the Book of Genesis*) is refreshing because it does not seek comprehensiveness, but treats a selection of passages, each in their own integrity as well as in their wider (inter-textual) resonances, allowing a broader, loose cohesiveness to emerge from the ground up. The result is a powerful flavour of (some of) the distinctive notes of the Hebrew Bible. At the same time (as reflected in the book's subtitle), Moberly reads as a Christian: this is displayed especially in his frequent choice to read the selected Old Testament passage in the company of New Testament passages, and in his periodic reflection on the possibilities of contemporary Christian appropriation of Old Testament passages. One of Moberly's key challenges is how to write both as a biblical scholar (with a concern for the ancient text in its own frame of reference) and as a Christian (for whom these texts continue to speak authoritatively).

I come at this review as a systematic theologian with hermeneutical interests, and so my comments will be focused accordingly. I will leave to others the task of responding from a biblical scholarly perspective.

The compelling character of Moberly's interpretive achievements is well captured by the term 'non-reductive'. I will expand on this under four heads (in the course of which some of the details of his study will emerge), before offering a critical appraisal from a hermeneutical perspective.

First, Moberly frequently homes in on the issue of genre. This enables him to focus on the concerns internal to the text without reducing them to the often rather different concerns of the text's interpreters. I will offer three examples. First, in his treatment of the story of the manna in Exodus 16 Moberly discusses the interpretation of a Cambridge physicist, Colin Humphreys, who offers a natural explanation of the gift of manna (suggesting that this invites recognition of God's involvement in the ordinariness of life, not only the extraordinary). Moberly's response is to draw attention to emphases within the narrative which are necessarily overlooked in such a reading, such as the lack of manna on the Sabbath, and the manna as a divine test. On his reading, in terms of the story's 'own framing concern[s]' (88), the manna has the purpose of inducting Israel into the ways of $\Upsilon\text{H}\text{W}\text{H}$, thus 'reconfigur[ing] and reconstitut[ing] the ordinary and everyday for Israel' (88). We turn, second, to Moberly's treatment of the book of Isaiah. Moberly has discussed earlier in relation to Jeremiah 18:7-10 a type of prophecy which is response-seeking (the predominant mode within the Old Testament), and he argues that the book of Isaiah conforms to this type. Long-term prophecy (of Jesus) is thus ruled out within the world of the text, because it is a matter of God's conditional